



February 25-26, 2009
Cloquet Forestry Center

“Speak Up Cards”

Questions to Individuals

Frellich & Seeley- Is it possible with a concerted international effort to reverse trends and get CO2 emissions back to a safe level?

Jean Coleman- The statewide conservation plan emphasizes carbon sequestration in context of biofuels vs. the best approach to capture benefits of sequestration.

Nate- Does designating allowances (versus affects) to age of forest sector address the difficult issues of additionally permanence vegetation?

Lee Frellich- Birch on the Minnesota North shore is in the largest decline I've seen in my history as a logger- What are the low latitudes to birch growing to high latitudes for birch?

Seeley/ Frellich- Mini Ice Age- Does the current warm up date from the end of the mini ice age in mid 1880's or was climate stable or relatively not warming until a much later date- like 1980's or? -John Bathke

Dave Epperly- What role will State (DNR) Forest Management Programs play in Carbon offsets?

Dave Epperly- What policies and measures have the DNR and USFS in place to ensure that increased exploration of forest biomass and waste for energy won't adversely affect forest ecosystems by removing excessive quantities of forest “waste”?

Frellich/ Seeley- (? To panel) What are some of the changes in species composition on MN Forest that have already occurred?

Jean Coleman- It will be nice to see the ‘Vulnerable key habitat by township’ map of MN on the net, so people can get a good idea of the area they inhabit and plan accordingly. What are plans to pass this to the public eye, and not just public agencies?

Jim Bowyer- How does substituting concrete for wood offset the increased energy for producing when the concrete serves as a heat sink with passive solar design? -Steve Olson

Demand Side: Reducing Consumption

Is part of the problem that people do not want to acknowledge/ accept their own responsibility (i.e. population & consumption) and how do we get past this? -Valiree Green- DNR

Has anybody calculated what the carbon footprint is of having meetings this way (everybody drives 100+ miles one-way, or flies, etc) vs. the carbon footprint of having a web-conference? Am I the only person who is questioning this? -Mitch Wilson

How about emphasizing reducing consumption of our natural resources as an option to reduce carbon emissions?

Forest Policy

While our science and research are great, it seems like we are only taking baby steps in the face of the full run of global climate change. When, how and if we expect to see the large scale change that we apparently need. (Aka as a 22 year old, can I be optimistic for enough change in time to make a difference?) - Concerned Young One

Since trees are so valuable for carbon sequestration, why not have a not yet loss for forest land? - Gary Anderson

No x emissions- There was a study done in Switzerland, the University of Edinburg (UK) and University of KY (US) that studied ethanol from corn & soybeans. They found a 50%-60% increase in NOx over the fuels they replaced. The increase is thought to come from Nitrogen fertilizer. Would cellulosic ethanol be a good way to mitigate this unfortunate consequence of agricultural ethanol?

Forest Management-

Our agency has moved to using ECS as a tool for directing the future of our forest stands. This tool uses a look back at what the forest supported, in the past. With changes in climate, temperature and precipitation patterns, will vegetation that occupy the site still be capable of surviving on this site under changing climate regime. Is there any discussion of modeling the climate/ veg. suitability in the future.

To Cap and Trade Specialists- If carbon sequestration becomes a well-paid use in a multiple- use forest, how will that affect the balance we now try to seek between water, wildlife, recreation and wood products? For example- do aggregation care if I plant my wildlife food plot to trees? (Somebody in WI extend the notation of their jack pine that was being used for Kirtland Warbler.)

Yes or No: Carbon credits will ultimately push agencies to longer rotation ages, winter harvests and increasing residual BA requirements. If yes, who will continue to purchase this old, low quality, winter

access only wood? Are carbon credits going to lead to further impacts on an already struggling MN Forest Industry?

Forestry offsets: Doesn't the B.A.O. approach to additionality penalize good managers (little additionality) and reward bad actors. How can this be successful (or avoided)? -P. Boney

If we are certain climate is changing, and will continue to change, and that climate will change our forests; why do forest management plan objectives tend toward historic forest composition and structure?

On our tour Wed (p.m.) Stand #1- The unmanaged stand has 56 cd/ac carbon seq. The managed one 48 c/ac. Are we going to let that drive our management of our forests? As foresters we need to deliver wood fiber for the needs of our nation. Contrary to what I learned as far as a forestry management student.

What are the risks to developing & implementing a program of forest management geared to carbon sequestration and credits ahead of the generally accepted protocol?

Researchers and scholars have done a great job of describing climate change. Now, what should we really do? Please tell us three things we should keep in mind while writing a stand level plan (a prescription)???

We have about 1.3 million acres of brushlands and open lands in MN. A percentage of these could be managed as Forests. Should we prescribe burning these; releasing carbon to keep them as brushland, OR should we manage as forests?

The Afforestation requirement will encourage Deforestation, not what I would envision as part of a solution.

Pertaining to Carbon credit cap, trade & offsets systems, it could be argued that the concept of "additionality" favours land managers/ owners that currently are doing nothing and discriminates against those that already practicing responsible & sustainable management. Same could be said for businesses/ manufacturers who are environmentally responsible. What is the solution to this and how can responsible forest managers be rewarded for their past and current actions with this system? (Rebecca Bernard)

Climate change has potential to significantly impact biodiversity in Minn. Though onset of invasive species, change in forest composition, etc. If a well managed forest with vigorously growing trees sequesters more carbon and is therefore better for reducing climate change- Are we taking the right approach when we manage our forests for old forest qualities, extended rotation, and retaining dead & down material? Does it make sense to do this in the name of preserving biodiversity?

The "improved forest practices" all focused on extended rotation, low intensity, later successional management practices. The science and data that Jim Bowyer presented contradicts these practices

supported by CCX & VCX. Why are management practices that support increased stacking and harvesting and use of forest products (=long term carbon storing) not recognized and how can this be included in current models/ systems?

Have there been studies to estimate which sequesters more carbon over time, an intensive of managed forest vs an old Growth Forest?

Cap & Trade Policy

How can we ensure that the benefits of carbon markets are distributed appropriately/ equitably? We must focus around this question in order for Carbon Market to gain effectiveness and meaning for MN citizens. I would argue that we must address small ownerships, subsistence practices and rural poverty.

How can the VCS system's reward for less intensive management be justified, given the carbon sequestration and storage advantages of younger, faster growing forests and forest product sequestration, substitution for fossil fuels, and short-term, long-term product storage?

Additionality- If the goal is carbon sequestration; shouldn't we be working to maximize the amount regardless of what previous management has been? Additionality would seem to reward past poor management and penalize past good management.

How can we put an economic value on our environment that represents the planet's ability to support life as we know it, rather than a planet that is not sustainable for vascular plants and higher classes of animal to even survive, much less thrive?

Is there or would it be useful, an estimate of how much carbon could realistically be sequestered on NIPF lands in MN? (i.e. set some targets, as in the "Million Acre" goal of Forest Stewardship plans). (Included, should be an estimate of current "abandoned farmland acres"). – Art Norton

What lessons can be learned (positive & negative) from Europe's Cap & Trade system?

It seems that there are differences in values and policies between CCX, California and East Coast- Carbon Credit Markets. Is there a movement to standardize contracts, offsets, values and policies of carbon market aggregations and carbon credit markets?

What does an average acre of forested land take in how many tons of carbon a year?

Do you agree that Cap and Trade will give the Gov't to pick which entities survive & which fail based on political whim, not merit or consumer (market) drivers. Why should a free market nation accept this type of economic policy that will cripple our economy?

Given the debate between food and fuel over corn biomass, do you foresee any scenarios where a carbon tax or cap and trade pushes woody biomass fuel prior to become high enough to affect traditional wood product practice or even cause good pulp need to be burned? If so, any comments on that effect?

For Cap & Trade policy: If other countries such as India or China do not follow with similar policies will we still plan to enact our own?

What has been the costs of implementing the Kyoto protocol and has there been any measured success? What will be a measurable level of success for Cap & Trade on CC markets?

Why would power-generating company pay to offset fossil fuel emissions when they could buy wood for less and burn the wood and leave the coal sequestered in the ground? Will offsets compete with the direct substitution of fossil fuel with biomass?

To Cap & Trade Experts: If additional atmosphere CO₂ inherently accelerates photosynthesis, then every forest tract provides additionality just by its existence. True? Y/N -Regarding Cap & Trade: How much thought has been given to rewarding forest landowners who avoid deforestation and thereby inherently provide additionality?

Carbon Credits seem to be based on sophisticated models crunching imprecise data- is there a better, simpler way to achieve the objectives? Ex.- Managed Forest= x per acre, prairie restoration= x per acre, etc. (Regional variations)

How is the value of carbon credits calculated and who sets the dollar value?

How will cap& trade impact GNP? How will carbon credit impact National Harvests? Business as usual- Keeping forest from free media- is valued for sequestration of CO₂.

The coal (fossil fuel) lobby/ industry has received \$3 million additional in the stimulus plan for geological sequestration of CO₂. What has Ag/forestry received?

Jean Coleman- Vehicle miles: A small car does not have the same impact as a large car (mpg), why not have a direct gas tax to address this discrepancy- this appears to favor tracking?